

COLLECTIVE IJTIHAD PRACTICE IN INDONESIA: The Role of Isbat Sessions in Addressing Legal Paradigm Differences Between Hisab-Rukyat

Suhar, AM*, Tasnim Rahman Fitra

UIN Sulthan Thaha Saifuddin Jambi

Jl. Jambi Ma. Bulian KM.16 Simpang Sungai Duren Kab. Muaro Jambi, Jambi 36361, Indonesia

email: suhar@uinjambi.ac.id

Abdurrohman Kasdi

IAIN Kudus

Jl. Conge Ngembalrejo Bae Kudus, Central Java, Indonesia

Khusnul Istiqomah

UIN Sulthan Thaha Saifuddin Jambi

Jl. Jambi Ma. Bulian KM.16 Simpang Sungai Duren Kab. Muaro Jambi, Jambi 36361, Indonesia

Abdurrahman

Institut Islam Muaro Jambi (INISMA)

Jl. Kapten A. Bakarudin no. 12 Kel. Beliang Kec. Kota Baru, Jambi, Indonesia

Humaira Ahmad

Department of Islamic Thought and Civilization, University of Management and Technology,
Pakistan

C-II Block C 2 Phase 1 Johar Town, Lahore, Punjab 54770, Pakistan

DOI: [10.30631/alrisalah.v24i2.1537](https://doi.org/10.30631/alrisalah.v24i2.1537)

Submitted: June 12, 2024; Revised: September 15, 2024; Accepted: December 30, 2024

Abstract: This article aims to promote the Isbat session as a collective ijihad practice that can overcome the differences in the legal paradigms of Hisab and Rukyat in determining the beginning of Ramadan in Indonesia. This study uses qualitative-descriptive analysis by observing the practice of the Isbat session in dealing with differences in the legal paradigms of Hisab-Rukyat in Indonesia. Primary data occasionally uses official documents from the Ministry of Religious Affairs regarding the Isbat Session. Then, secondary data is elaborated on, especially the opinions of scholars regarding the role of collective ijihad in dealing with differences in the paradigms of Islamic law. The article finds that the Isbat Session is a real example of the practice of collective ijihad in Indonesia, which combines religious values, science, and the principle of deliberation. Its role is very significant in bringing together the diversity of paradigms and legal views of the Islamic community in Indonesia. Furthermore, the practice of the Isbat session also influences the socio-community aspect, strengthening the unity of Muslims amidst the diversity of legal methods and views. This article contributes to the

development of Islamic legal science and will become a reference for academics on related issues.

Keywords: Collective Ijtihad, Isbat Session, Differences in legal paradigms, Hisab-Rukyat

Abstrak: Artikel ini bertujuan untuk mempromosikan sidang isbat sebagai praktek ijtihad kolektif yang dapat menangani perbedaan paradigma hukum Hisab dan Rukyat dalam penentuan awal Ramadhan di Indonesia. Penelitian ini menggunakan analisis kualitatif-deskriptif dengan meneropong pengamalan sidang Isbat dalam menghadapi perbedaan perbedaan paradigma hukum Hisab-Rukyat di Indonesia. Data primer menggunakan dokumen-dokumen resmi Kementerian Agama mengenai Sidang Isbat dari masa ke masa. Kemudian data dielaborasi dengan data sekunder khususnya pendapat sarjana mengenai peranan ijtihad kolektif dalam menghadapi perbedaan paradigma hukum Islam. Artikel mendapati bahwa Sidang Isbat merupakan contoh nyata dari praktik ijtihad kolektif di Indonesia, yang memadukan nilai-nilai keagamaan, ilmu pengetahuan, dan prinsip musyawarah. Perannya sangat signifikan dalam mempertemukan keragaman paradigma dan pandangan hukum masyarakat Islam di Indonesia. Lebih lanjut, praktek sidang isbat juga berpengaruh pada aspek social-kemasyarakatan dalam memperkuat persatuan umat Islam di tengah keragaman metode hukum dan pandangan. Artikel ini berkontribusi terhadap pengembangan keilmuan hukum islam untuk menjadi rujukan akademisi pada isu terkait.

Kata Kunci: Collective Ijtihad, Sidang Isbat, Perbedaan paradigma hukum, Hisab-Rukyat.

Introduction

The practice of collective ijtihad in Indonesia faces complex challenges in the Indonesian context.¹ As is known, collective ijtihad is a mechanism for determining Islamic law (fiqh) by Islamic scholars (muftahids) together to produce legal decisions on current thematic problems. The definition of collective ijtihad requires the agreement of many scholars and muftahids to resolve the legal issues of the community. The existing conditions of diversity of schools of thought and the social structure of Indonesian society provide a very big challenge to implementing the practice of collective ijtihad in Indonesia.

Scholars have formulated the urgency of collective ijtihad to overcome the problems of contemporary social and legal change.² M. Pauzi et al. stated that collective ijtihad in Indonesia is expected to provide relevant, fair, and appropriate Islamic legal solutions to society's needs. Collective ijtihad is very helpful in formulating contemporary fiqh by adding technological and scientific instruments. He continued that the study results showed that collective ijtihad is more solid, closer to the truth, and helps avoid conflict than individual ijtihad.³

Although awareness of the importance of collective ijtihad is urgent, the reality of

¹ Artinyain, Ijtihad Jama'i as a "Solution" to Social Problems, Jurnal Asy-Syir'ah Vol. 43 No. II, 200

² Andoko. Study on Building Collective Ijtihad as an Effort of Istibat Al Ahkam Against

Contemporary Events. Responsive Law Journal, [SI], v. 7, n. 7, p. 40-52, May 2019.

³ Pauzi M and Darul Hipni, The Importance Of The Ijtihad Jama'i Method In Contemporary Fiqh Formulations, Al-Risalah Forum Kajian Hukum

Indonesia, as a country with the largest Muslim population in the world, consisting of various backgrounds of fiqh schools and schools of thought, makes implementing the practice of collective ijtihad a challenge in itself.⁴ Indonesian Muslim society that adheres to multiple schools of thought, such as Shafi'i, Hanafi, and even contemporary thought, has given rise to different approaches to understanding Sharia, often leading to differences of opinion that are difficult to unite. In addition to differences in schools of thought, in some cases, collective ijtihad also faces pressure from certain parties with political or economic interests so that external factors can influence decisions. This is exacerbated by the polarization between conservative, moderate, and progressive Islamic groups, which further complicates the practice of collective ijtihad in Indonesia.⁵

In a broader aspect, collective ijtihad is also often hampered by Indonesia's Social and Cultural diversity. A country with a very diverse society in terms of culture, language, and customs usually makes the results of collective ijtihad difficult to accept widely because not all local contexts are accommodated. This results in the Community's acceptance of collective decisions, sometimes not by the understanding of the general public, who are already rooted in certain traditions, thus giving rise to resistance. The challenge of collective ijtihad is also faced with the rapid changes of the era that challenge ijtihad about modern issues, such as fintech, bioethics, the

environment, and artificial intelligence. Ulama is often left behind in understanding the implications of this problem. Information overload, marked by technological advances and widespread information, has caused confusion or differences of opinion among people.⁶

One of the real diversities and differences in Indonesia can be seen from the problem of determining the beginning of the Hijri month. The difference in determining the beginning of the Qomariyah calendar has resulted in a long debate about the implementation of the hisab and rakyat methods. This debate has influenced the political-social aspects that have triggered wider disputes in Indonesian Muslim society. This has become a serious concern for Islamic law academics in Indonesia.⁷

The difference in results between the hijab and rakyat methods often causes differences in determining holidays (Eid al-Fitr or Eid al-Adha). This can create dualism in society's celebrations, where some groups celebrate earlier or later than other groups. This disagreement sometimes causes debate in society that impacts social, economic, and cultural aspects.⁸

The Hijri calendar is one of the systems used by Muslims worldwide, including Indonesia, to determine various meaningful worships such as fasting, Eid al-Fitr, and Eid al-Adha. However, determining the beginning of the Hijri month, primarily related to the start of Ramadan, Shawwal, and Dzulhijah, faces

dan Sosial Kemasyarakatan Vol. 23 No. 1, June 2023 (pp. 13-20), DOI: 10.30631/alrisalah.v23i1.1322

⁴ Sudirman, Sudirman, Edi Gunawan, and Kasjim Salenda. "Method of law istinbath jama'ah al-Nadzir: determination of the beginning of the month of Ramadhan." *Ijtihad: Jurnal Wacana Hukum Islam dan Kemanusiaan* 19.2 (2019): 259-270.

⁵ Erwan, Erwan. "Takhrij Al-Furu'Alal Usul Periode Ijtihad Di Masa Shahabat Dan Tabi'in

(Kajian Sosiologi-Antropologi Hukum Islam)." *JURIS (Jurnal Ilmiah Syariah)* 17.2 (2018): 161-179.

⁶ Amin Rido, *Problems of Jama'i Ijtihad in the Face of Modernity*, Thesis, Faculty of Sharia, UIN Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, 2001

⁷ Rojak, Encep Abdul, and Ramdan Fawzi. "The Normative Basis of Islamic Astronomy For The Transformation of Prayer Schedules To Digital And Its Accuracy." *El-Usrah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga* 7.2 (2024).

⁸ Ridwan, *Contestation of Hisab-Rukyat Schools in Indonesia*, Pustaka Ilmu, 2022

problems in daily practice due to differences in methods used by various parties. In Indonesia, the primary methods are hisab (astronomical calculations) and rakyat (visual observation of the crescent moon). Although both of these methods have a valid scientific and Sharia basis, differences in interpretation in their use often lead to a prolonged debate among Muslims, as well as between the community and the government.⁹

Hisab, which relies on astronomical calculations, aims to mathematically calculate the crescent moon's position and provide a prediction of when the new month begins. At the same time, Rukyah prioritizes direct observation of the crescent moon as a sign of the start of the new month. In practice, the difference in results can cause disagreement in determining the first day of Ramadan or Eid al-Fitr.¹⁰

This problem is further complicated by the various opinions expressed by different Islamic scholars and organizations in Indonesia, each claiming the truth of its methodology.¹¹

Amidst these differences, the Indonesian government, through the Ministry of Religion, plays a vital role in unifying views and making decisions expected to be accepted by all Muslims while still prioritizing the common good and ensuring community unity. The Ministry of Religion initiated the implementation of the isbat session to determine 1 Syawal. The bat session (determination) is a practice in Indonesia to determine the beginning of the Hijri month,

including deciding 1 Syawal, which marks Eid al-Fitr. This session is organized by the Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia and attended by various interested parties. The Minister of Religion leads the discussion and makes a decision based on the results of observations of the crescent moon (rakyat) and astronomical calculations (this). After a decision is made, the results are announced to the public. The Minister of Religion announces the conclusion of the bat session through a press conference broadcast live by the media. This announcement states whether 1 Syawal falls on the same day as the calendar estimate or is postponed to the next day.¹² The bat session reflects the spirit of deliberation and unity in Indonesia, a society with diverse religious views. Although there are sometimes differences, the bat session remains an important moment to maintain togetherness in carrying out worship and celebrating religious holidays.¹³

This article will answer the question: is the 1st Syawal isbat session a collective ijihad practice? For that, three research formulations are formulated: 1) What is collective ijihad, and what are its terms and conditions? 2) How is the practice of the 1st Syawal Isbat session in Indonesia? 3) How does the Isbat session impact religious life in Indonesia? The research used a qualitative descriptive method by comparing the concept of collective ijihad outlined by Islamic law and Sharia literature scholars with the practice of the 1st Syawal isbat session in Indonesia. The primary data used in the analysis is in the form of a literature review

⁹ Imroatul Munfaridah, Problems of Hisab Rukyah in Determining the Beginning of Ramadan and Solutions in Indonesia, MUADDIB: Educational and Islamic Studies,

¹⁰ Harnowo, Tri, and Fachry Hasani Habib. "Islamic Law and Environment Issues: Indonesian Ulama Council's Fatwas on Climate Change." AHKAM: Jurnal Ilmu Syariah 24.1 (2024): 101-118.

¹¹ Muhammad Izzuddin, Dynamics of Hisab Rukyah in Indonesia. (2015). Istinbath: Journal of Law, 12(2), 248-273.

¹² Mulyadi, Achmad. "Non-Astronomical Aspects of the Success of Rukyatul Hilal in East Java." Samarah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga dan Hukum Islam 8.3 (2024): 1859-1880.

¹³ Royyani, Muh Arif, et al. "Shahadah'Ilmy; Integrating Fiqh and Astronomy Paradigm in Determining The Arrival of Lunar Months in Indonesia." AL-IHKAM: Jurnal Hukum & Pranata Sosial 16.2 (2021): 503-524.

on the concept of collective ijtihad, which is then matched with data on the practice of the isbat session through interviews with actors and news and confirmation from the Institution.

Method

This study uses a descriptive qualitative method to analyze the practice of collective ijtihad in isbat sessions in Indonesia. Data collection techniques were carried out through in-depth interviews with scholars, officials of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, and representatives of Islamic organizations involved in the isbat session, as well as participant observation of the isbat session process. In addition, secondary data were obtained from official documents, such as isbat session reports and literature related to collective ijtihad, his-rakyat, and Islamic law. The data collected were analyzed using a data reduction approach to filter relevant information, presenting data through diagrams or matrices to understand the relationship between variables and drawing conclusions based on data interpretation. This study also adopted a comparative analysis by comparing the practice of collective ijtihad in isbat sessions with the theory of jama'i ijtihad in Islamic literature and assessing its impact on the unity of the people, legal certainty, and social harmony. A multidisciplinary approach that integrates the perspectives of Islamic law, astronomy, and sociology is used to provide a comprehensive understanding of this complex issue.

Collective Ijtihad Facing Hisab-Rukyat Problems

Human life experiences change and is decorated with various problems. During the period of Muhammad SAW's prophethood, there were almost no problems of division among Muslims. Every problem could be asked of the Prophet SAW. Differences of opinion arose after the Prophet SAW died

because of problems that had no precedent in the era of the Prophethood.

Ibn Rushd later confirmed this. In a book entitled *Bidayat al-Mujtahid*, Ibn Rushd describes that the primary source of Islamic law cannot be reproduced (*mutanahiyat*). At the same time, the reality of the universe and human life continues without limits (*ghair mutanahiyat*). In other words, after the Prophet SAW died, the text of the Qur'an and al-Sunnah stopped and could not be added, while religious issues in society continued to roll.

Ijtihad collective, or what in the context of fiqh is called ijtihad jama'i, is a form of ijtihad carried out collectively by a group of scholars with expertise in Islamic law. This concept aims to answer complex legal problems in the contemporary era, where these problems require a multidisciplinary perspective and more comprehensive decision-making. In ijtihad jama'i, scholars deliberate to reach a legal agreement based on valid sharia arguments, considering *maqāṣid al-sharī'ah* (the goals of sharia). Collective ijtihad is a joint effort by scholars or Islamic jurists to reason and interpret law on issues not explicitly explained in the primary sources of Islamic law, namely the Qur'an and Hadith. Collective ijtihad is carried out in response to complex modern challenges and requires various scientific perspectives.

Ulama has outlined the characteristics of Collective Ijtihad, including:

1. Done collaboratively: Involving several experts with different expertise, such as experts in Islamic law, economics, sociology, and other relevant fields.
2. Involving formal institutions: This is usually carried out in official institutions such as the Ulama Council, religious organizations, or international conferences of the ulama.
3. Dealing with contemporary issues: The problems often relate to modern topics that are not in classical societies.

4. Based on deliberation: Decisions are taken based on deliberation and consensus, although there may be differences of opinion.¹⁴

Scholars have also explained the benefits of Collective Ijtihad for Muslim society. First, Collective Ijtihad produces more mature and relevant legal solutions because it involves various perspectives. Second, it is based on the needs of modern society. Third, Increasing legitimacy: Decisions taken together tend to be more accepted by the community because many scholars support them. Therefore, with this approach, collective ijtiḥād becomes a critical way to maintain the relevance of Islamic law in responding to the needs of the times.

According to Imam al-Syātibī, ijtiḥād depends not only on individual skills but also on the social context and needs of society. In al-Muwāfaqāt, he emphasized the importance of a collective approach to understanding dynamic interests. This opinion is reinforced by Sheikh Wahbah al-Zuhaili, who stated that collective ijtiḥād can effectively overcome the challenges of Islamic law in the modern world, especially in economics, technology, and politics.¹⁵ As a comparison, al-Ghazali in al-Mustasfa emphasizes the importance of the role of individual mujtahids who have scientific and spiritual integrity. Although al-Ghazali does not explicitly discuss ijtiḥād jama'i, his opinion is often used by more conservative scholars as a basis that the responsibility for ijtiḥād lies on the shoulders of individual scholars who meet specific criteria (syurūṭ al-mujtahid).¹⁶ However, this view is beginning

to shift as the complexity of legal issues increases, requiring interdisciplinary collaboration.

The practice of ijtiḥād jama'i has been widely applied by contemporary fatwa institutions, such as the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI), Rabithah Alam Islami, and Dar al-Ifta' al-Misriyyah. In Indonesia, MUI is one of the representatives of the implementation of ijtiḥād jama'i, the process of which is in the fatwa commission session and involves experts from various fields. The decisions are based on sharia studies and consider social, cultural, and economic aspects. In addition, the Itsbat Session to determine the beginning of the Kamariyah month by the Indonesian Ministry of Religion is also a concrete example of the implementation of ijtiḥād jama'i in Indonesia, of course, in the broader scope, where the government cq. Kemenag RI presents it by presenting government representatives, Islamic mass organizations, community leaders, and others.¹⁷ His decision became the basis for determining the beginning of the month in Indonesia.

Community Ijtihad provides flexibility when facing the challenges of the times. Classical scholars such as al-Syāfi'i tend to emphasize individual knowledge. In contrast, contemporary scholars such as Yusuf al-Qaradawi see ijtiḥād jama'i as a manifestation of the concept of shura in Islam. This approach provides space for a more inclusive resolution of legal problems. So, in general, it can be said that ijtiḥād jama'i is a form of renewal in the Islamic legal tradition relevant to the times' needs.¹⁸ With the collaboration of ulama, who have a variety of expertise, this

¹⁴ Faishal Agil Al Munawar and Mirwan, Ijtihad Jama'i (Collective Ijtihad) from the Perspective of Contemporary Ulama, Journal of Islamic Economics and Law Volume 4, Number 2, October 2020, DOI: 10.35316/istidlal.v4i1.268

¹⁵ Kasdi, Abdurrohman. "Reconstruction of Nusantara fiqh: Developing the Ijtihad methodology in formulating fiqh from an Indonesian perspective." QIJIS STAIN KUDUS 7.2 (2019): 239-266.

¹⁶ Laluddin, Hayatullah. "Maslahah's Role as an Instrument for Revival of Ijtihad." International Journal of Islamic Thought 8 (2015): 27.

¹⁷ Laluddin, Hayatullah. "Maslahah's Role as an Instrument for Revival of Ijtihad." International Journal of Islamic Thought 8 (2015): 27.

¹⁸ Hidayat, Muhammad, and Muhammad Ikhlas bin Rosele. "Modernization Of Fiqh In Contemporary Era: A Study of Yusuf Al-Qardhawi's Fiqh

ijtihad can produce legal solutions that are more comprehensive and in line with the demands of *maqāṣid al-sharī'ah*. Therefore, *jama'i ijtihad* is an approach that needs to continue to be developed to answer various challenges in Islamic law today and in the future.

Dr. H. Khaeruddin Khamsin, Deputy Chairman of the Tarjih and Tajdid Council of the Muhammadiyah Central Executive Board, said that in this era, it seems that we will have difficulty finding people who have the perfect capacity as absolute mujtahids like Imam al-Syafi'i or Imam Abu Hanifah. Let alone absolute mujtahids, even the level of mujtahids of the *madhhab* who are experts in the *Shafi'iyah* method, is already challenging. Therefore, what can be done now is to gather several experts to discuss in collective ijtihad or *jama'i ijtihad*.

Collective ijtihad (*Ijtihad Jama'i*) is considered the right solution to overcome the crisis of thought in the Muslim world because it allows the resolution of modern, contemporary, and complex problems and tends to reduce the fanaticism of Islamic legal schools. One reason is that a number of Muslim scholars from various schools and disciplines can sit together to conduct ijtihad collectively. This is different from the beginning of the formation of schools when scholars individually interpreted the Holy Book.¹⁹

Quoting Nadirsyah Hosen, this collective ijtihad procedure is followed because Muslim scholars appreciate and understand that problems in the modern era are much more

complex than in the time of the prophethood fifteen centuries ago. Therefore, the Muslim community today expects Muslim scholars to provide broad answers to their problems, not only from the perspective of Islamic law but also from other perspectives.²⁰

With ijtihad *jama'i*, all "absolute mujtahids" in various disciplines, including science, social sciences, and Islamic law, can come together to formulate a legal product that is progressive, wise, and just. In the preparation of *Fiqh for the Disabled*, for example, the Muhammadiyah Tarjih and Tajdid Council not only invited Islamic law experts but also invited disability activists, including people with disabilities.²¹

Khaeruddin Khamsin said that collective Ijtihad is usually carried out by a fatwa institution with full authority from the State and its society. In the Middle East, there is *Dar al-Ifta* in Egypt, the oldest official fatwa institution that still exists today. In Europe, there is The European Council For Fatwa and Research; this fatwa institution is independent and combines many great scholars from various countries worldwide. We have several Islamic fatwa institutions in Indonesia, including the Majelis Tarjih and Tajdid PP Muhammadiyah, the Bahtsul Masail Institute Nahdlatul Ulama, and the Indonesian Ulema Council.²²

The emergence of differences in determining the beginning of the lunar month is caused by three important things, namely the definition of *hilal*, the method for knowing the *hilal*, and the Islamic calendar system. These three things are intertwined and cannot be separated from each other. Various classical

Thought." MIQOT: Journal of Islamic Sciences 48.1 (2024): 73-87.

¹⁹ Hasan, A. (2003). An Introduction to Collective Ijtihad (*Ijtihad Jama'i*): Concept and Applications. *American Journal of Islam and Society*, 20(2), 26-49. <https://doi.org/10.35632/ajis.v20i2.520>

²⁰ Nadirsyah Hosen, Nahdlatul Ulama and Collective Ijtihad, *New Zealand Journal of Asian Studies* 6, 1 (June, 2004): 5-26.

²¹ Khan, S. (2024). Collective Ijtihad: Regulating Fatwa in Postnormal Times: (By Hossam Sabry Othman). *American Journal of Islam and Society*, 41(3-4), 102-107.

²² Maqbool Hassan, The Concept of Collective Ijtihad, its Need and Role in the Development of Islamic Law and Legislation in the Modern Era, *almithaq Journal*, 6 Sep 2024, <https://almithaqjournal.org/index.php/home/article/view/66/62>

and contemporary literature have discussed the issue of hilal using multiple approaches. Ibn Manzur in *Lisan al-'Araby* describes the origin and meaning of the word "hilal" at length. According to him, what is meant by hilal is the crescent moon on the first and second day of the lunar month or the last two nights. This opinion is based on Abi Haitham. Furthermore, *al-Qamus al-Muhit* explains that what is meant by hilal is the crescent moon (2-3 nights from the beginning of the month / 7-2 nights from the end of the month). The *Al-Munawwir Dictionary* followed this opinion. However, the *al-Munawwir Dictionary* also explains the various meanings of the word hilal. According to him, the word hilal has twelve meanings. The meanings are the crescent moon, camel's seal, the moon seen at the beginning of the month, thin camel, rainfall, snakeskin, the beginning of rain, dust, little water, male snake, white color at the base of the nail, and promising young man. In the *Arabic-English Dictionary* by Hans Wehr, the word hilal, the plural form of chalah or ahalil, can mean new moons or crescents.²³

Meanwhile, scientists tried to formulate the crescent moon through rationalization and interpretation of holy books, observation, and experimentation, which finally produced two approaches: theoretical and empirical. In the golden age of Islam, Nashiruddin al-Tusi pioneered the theoretical approach, while al-Biruni pioneered the empirical approach.

In the modern era, the theoretical approach was pioneered by Bruin, while Maunder pioneered the empirical approach. Currently, the world record for the youngest crescent moon visible with binoculars is the crescent moon at the beginning of Ramadan 1416 H (January 21, 1991) with a moon age of 12

hours 07 minutes which Jim Stamm saw in Tuscon, Arizona, United States. So far, the parameters of crescent visibility have been greatly influenced by the limits of Danjon and Mohammad Ilyas. In the case of Indonesia, the theoretical approach was pioneered by Muhammadiyah, who carried the theory of wujudul hilal to determine the beginning of the lunar month. At the same time, Nahdlatul Ulama used the empirical approach by using the visibility of the crescent moon as a guide in making observations. For NU, as stated by Ghazali Masruri, the crescent moon must be visible and apparent. This difference in approach is one of the sources of problems in determining the beginning of the lunar month in Indonesia.²⁴

The second problem is using hisab and rukyat to determine the beginning of the lunar month. Until now, the hisab-rukyat debate has not been resolved; each party feels it is more by the message of the NAS. In Indonesia, this difference is very apparent between Muhammadiyah and Nahdlatul Ulama (NU). For NU, the position of hisab is only to assist in implementing rukyatul hilal in the field. Therefore, even though they have made predictions, they do not dare to confirm the beginning of the month of Ramadan, Shawwal, and Zulhijah with this, but they are still waiting for the results of observations in the field. As is well known, NU repeats the hadith of the Prophet SAW. *sumu li ru'yatihi* as justification. They admit that the word hilal (new moon) in QS al-Baqarah verse 189 is general. However, at the beginning of Ramadan and Shawwal, the rakyat hadiths are considered the firmest and most transparent basis for the estimate. Strictly speaking, rukyat is the primary basis for NU

²³ Abdul Helim, Hamka's Legal Methodology on Hisab-Ru'yah in His Book "I Return to Ru'yah", *JURIS (Jurnal Ilmiah Syariah)*, Vol. 23, No. 2 (2024), pp. 215-226, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.31958/juris.v23i2.11952/>

²⁴ Haryanto, AM (2023). Hisab and Rukyat in Determining the Beginning of the Qamariyah Month in Indonesia from a Hadith Perspective. *Al-Mu'tabar*, 3(2), 45-60. https://doi.org/10.56874/jurnal_ilmu_hadis.v3i2.1553

when determining the beginning and end of Ramadan.²⁵

NU's stance is similar to that of Saudi Arabia, Syria, Morocco,³¹ and Bahrain. Sheikhul Islam Ibn Taimiyah, as quoted by Nurcholish Madjid, also supports the use of rukyat. According to him, the science of hisab, although logical, its truth can be trusted and is closer to the truth than other sciences. However, it still has limitations in capturing divine messages, primarily in determining the beginning of the lunar month (the start of Ramadan and Shawwal). Ibn Taimiyah emphasized that deductive reasoning will not bring human happiness. Ibn Taimiyah's argument is understandable because, at that time, people had forgotten religious laws and worshipped positivistic sciences. So, his position is not to justify right or wrong but to want to return science to its origin (the Qur'an and Sunnah). Likewise, Sheikh Abdullah bin Baz, Chairman of the Lajnah Daimah for Scientific Research and Fatwa Saudi Arabia, thinks that starting the beginning of Ramadan and Shawwal should only be done with rukyat or intimal. This is based on an authentic hadith, "fast because you see it (hilal), and break your fast because you see it (hilal), but if clouds cover it, then complete the month of Shaban for thirty days. Furthermore, Abdullah bin Baz considers the use of astronomy (hisab) in determining the start of Ramadan and Shawwal to be a heresy with no goodness in it and no basis in the Shari'ah.²⁶

The Council of Senior Ulama has approved Abdullah Bin Baz's opinion in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. As a result, most scholars in Saudi Arabia think that hisab is a bid. However, in its development, since

1430/2009 in Saudi Arabia in determining the beginning of Ramadan, Shawwal, and Zulhijah not only using rukyat but also paying attention to the results of this by involving astronomers in the Assembly of al-Qada' al A'la. This paradigm shift is based on input and criticism from various parties, such as the research results of Ayman Kordi, an Islamic astronomy expert from King Saud University, concluding that for 40 years, the results of rukyatul hilal announced by the Saudi Arabian government were 87% wrong and could not be scientifically accounted for.²⁷

Meanwhile, Islamic Organizations Abroad that support the use of rukyat to determine the beginning of Ramadan and Shawwal include the Hilal Sighting Committee of North America and the Hilal Committee of Metropolitan Toronto. According to them, hisab cannot be used as a valid way to determine the Hijri Calendar. The results of hisab can only be used as a guide if it is impossible to see the hilal. The evidence used is QS al-Baqarah verse 185 and the hadiths of rukyat. All of them are interpreted as seeing the hilal visually and are included in the worship process, which cannot be replaced by hisab.³⁹ On February 11-13, 2012, the "Itsbatu asySyuhur al-Qamariyah baina ulama asy-Syari'ati wa al-Hisabi al-Falaky" conference was held in Mecca al-Mukarramah. This conference was organized by Rabitah 'Alam al-Islamiy. The results of this conference recommended the formation of a committee consisting of astronomy experts and scholars to unify the beginning of the Hijri month in Muslim countries. This committee will determine Mecca as the center of observation and create a Hijri calendar that applies to all Muslim countries. This

²⁵ Abdur Rokhim, An Analysis of the Arguments of the Hisab and Rukyat Methods in the Perspective of Contextual Interpretation, , Jurnal Bimas Islam Vol 17 No. 1,

²⁶ Susiknan Azhari, Characteristics of the Relationship between Muhammadiyah and NU in

Using Hisab and Rukyat, Al-Jami'Ah, Vol. 44, No. 2, 2006 M/1427 H

²⁷ Muhamad Adib Abdul Haq, Implementation of Ru'yah Al-Hilal from the Perspective of the Pbnul Falakiyah Institution (Study on the Cancellation of Istikmal in the Month of Jumadil Awal 1438 H / 2017 M), Thesis, UIN Walisongo Semarang, 2022

conference emphasized the importance of observation in determining the beginning of Ramadan, Shawwal, and Zulhijah. The participants stated that Islam does not mind using modern technology to observe the beginning of the Hijri month. The participants also agreed that those who live in countries where Muslims are a minority must start and end the Ramadan fast if the new moon is observed in any region in the country. If they cannot observe the new moon for various reasons, they can follow the nearest Muslim country or Muslim community.²⁸

Meanwhile, Muhammadiyah links the ideal dimensions of revelation and human civilization. Therefore, in determining the beginning of Ramadan and Shawwal, Muhammadiyah does not only use rakyat but also uses his. For Muhammadiyah, which develops rational-scientific reasoning, rukyat is not only understood partially but is dialogued with related verses, such as QS al-Baqarah verse 185, QS Yunus verse 5, QS Yasin verses 39-40, and QS Ar-Rahman verse 5 so that the methodology developed by Muhammadiyah in determining the beginning of the lunar month is very elastic-productive. Hisab is not only focused on the months of Ramadan and Shawwal but is used in an Islamic calendar system, namely from Muharam to Zulhijah. The permissibility of using this is reinforced by historical data that determines the beginning of the lunar month is not solely by rakyat but can be used by his.

Asjmuni Abdurrahman emphasized with his statement that determining the beginning of Ramadan and Shawwal with hisab is not only in the present time. If we open the book *Bidayatul Mujtahid* compiled by Ibn Rushd, a Maliki scholar (520-595 H/1126-1198 AD), we

will find that the use of hisab by some scholars since the time of the companions or tabi'in. In this book, determining the beginning of the month if done rukyat is not visible because it is cloudy, then by doing hisab. This has been done by some salaf scholars, pioneered by a senior tabi'in figure named Matarif bin Asy-star. Some Syafi'iyah scholars state that experts in this and those who believe (in the truth of his calculations) must fast based on his.

Muhammadiyah's argument above is in line with the description contained in the Islamic Encyclopedia, which states that among the scholars who are interested in determining the beginning or end of the month of Ramadan using reckoning are Ibn Banna, Ibn Suraij, al-Qaffal, Kadi Abu Taib, Ibnu Qutaibah, Ibnu Muqatil ar-Razi, Ibn Daqiq al-Id, and Subki. Meanwhile, 20th-century scholars who used calculations to determine the beginning or end of the month of Ramadan were Muhammad Rasyid Rida and Tantawijauhari. The Muhammadiyah thought pattern above is the same as that developed in Malaysia, Pakistan, Tajikistan, and Egypt.²⁹

Yusuf al-Qaradlawi, one of the scholars and thinkers of Islam of this century, also called for the use of this in determining the beginning and end of Ramadan to reduce the differences that usually occur when entering the beginning of fasting and Eid al-Fitr. For him, the hadiths about rukyat must be read situationally-contextually. At that time, the command to use rukyat to determine the beginning of Ramadan and Shawwal was very relevant to the conditions of the local community. However, now that human civilization has developed rapidly and is

²⁸ Wildani Hefni, *Commodification of Religion in the Polemic on Determining the Beginning of the Qamariah Month in Indonesia*, *Al-Marshad: Journal of Islamic Astronomy and Related Sciences*, Vol 6, No 1 (2020).

²⁹ Mualimin Mochammad Sahid, Habibulla, Abdul Rahman Cemda, Mario, Kasduri, *Lunar Crescent*

Visibility Criteria in Determining the New Islamic Month in Malaysia, *Al-Hisab: Journal of Islamic Astronomy*, Vol.1, No.4, December 2024, pp. 197 – 209, <https://jurnal.umsu.ac.id/index.php/alhisab/article/view/21764>

supported by sophisticated technology, using hisab is the best solution.

As-Subki, in his Fatawa, as quoted by Yusuf al-Qaradlawi, stated that this is *Kathi*, while rakyat is *zany*. Therefore, Muhammad Syakir's use of hisab in the modern era is necessary. This is because the law regarding determining the month's entry with rukyat is associated with a cause (*ill at*) explained by the as-Sunnah itself. Whereas the "cause" in the present time is no longer there, and as has been established, every law runs with its Allah, in its existence or absence. Several prominent modern jurists, such as Sheikh Mustafa Ahmad Az-Zarqa and Abbas al-Jirari, also called on Muslims to use this. An Islamic organization outside Indonesia that supports the use of hisab is the Islamic Society of North America (ISNA). Initially, ISNA used rukyat to determine the beginning of Ramadan, Shawwal, and Zulhijah. However, after conducting an extended study with the Committee for Crescent Observation (CFCO) from 1994 to 2006 (12 years), ISNA finally concluded that the rukyat method could not determine the beginning of Ramadan and Shawwal. Likewise, in a conference entitled "Jadaliyah al-'Alaqah banana al-Fiqh wa al-Falaki" held in Lebanon on 10-12 Rabi'ul awal 1431 H / 25-26 February 2010 which presented speakers Yusuf Marwah (Canada), Mohammad Odeh (ICOP), Salih al-Ujairy (Kuwait), Khalid az-Zaaq (Saudi Arabia), Muhammad alUshairy (Syria), and Musallam Syalthout (Egypt) agreed to use hisab to determine the beginning of the lunar month to realize the Islamic calendar.

Isbat Session as A Collective Ijtihad Practice in Indonesia

The bat session is an official forum held by the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic

of Indonesia to determine the beginning of the month in the Hijri calendar, especially the start of Ramadan, Eid al-Fitr, and Eid al-Adha. This session aims to ensure uniformity during Islamic worship throughout Indonesia. Determination of the beginning of the Hijri month in the pre-independence period was traditionally carried out by each Muslim community, based on the rukyatul hilal (seeing the moon) or hisab (astronomical calculation) method. There is no formal mechanism that regulates this nationally.³⁰

After Indonesia's independence in 1945, the need for uniformity in determining the beginning of the Hijri month began to be felt. Through the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the government started to take a role in unifying the method of determining the beginning of the month, especially for major holidays such as Ramadan and Eid al-Fitr. The bat session was first formally held by the Ministry of Religious Affairs in the 1950s. This forum invited scholars, Islamic mass organizations, and astronomy experts to discuss and determine the beginning of the Hijri month based on reports of rukyat (hilal observations) in various regions of Indonesia.

The Isbat Session is an official meeting held to determine or ratify something related to worship times, such as the beginning of the month in the Hijri calendar. In Indonesia, the bat session is usually used to determine the beginning of Ramadan (the fasting month), Eid al-Fitr (1 Shawwal), and Eid al-Adha (10 Dzulhijjah).³¹

This session was organized by the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia by involving various experts in Religion (Ulama), the Meteorology and Geophysics Agency, Astronomy, Mass Organizations,

³⁰ Qulub, Siti Tatmainul, and Ahmad Munif. "The Urgency of Fatwa and Isbat Assemblies in Determining the Beginning of the Month of Kamariah in Indonesia." *Jurnal Bimas Islam* 16, no. 2 (December 29, 2023): 423–452. Accessed January 1, 2025.

³¹ Siti Tatmainul Qulub, *Critical Review of the Decision of the Itsbat Trial for Determining the Beginning of the Qamariyah Month in Indonesia from the Perspective of Usul Fiqh*, AL-AHKAM, Volume 25, Number 1, April 2015

Regional Governments, etc., totaling 200 people. The Isbat Session process is usually carried out using two main methods. The first is Hisab, an astronomical calculation to determine the position of the hilal (first crescent moon) before the beginning of the Hijri month. Second, Rukyat: Direct observation of the hilal using the naked eye or optical aids. If the hilal is visible (rukayat) or the calculation (hisab) shows a clear possibility, the session results will be agreed upon and officially announced by the government.

According to the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Isbat Session aims to unite Muslims in Indonesia in carrying out worship based on the valid and official calendar so that there are no significant differences in implementing Islamic holidays. Since 1946, the first year of the establishment of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, regulations have been issued regarding the authority to determine holidays related to worship as Holidays. The regulation in question is the Government Decree of 1946 Number 2/U.M. According to the considerations of the Government Decree, it is necessary to make regulations regarding holidays after hearing the Working Body of the Central National Committee so that each year, the Minister of Religious Affairs will determine the holidays.

32

Since the 1950s, some sources mention 1962, the first Isbat Session was held to determine the date of 1 Ramadan and Eid al-Fitr. The Isbat Session was filled with presentations from scholars/experts and opinions from Islamic organizations before deciding on the start of Ramadan and Eid al-Fitr, which was announced to the public. The Isbat Session for the start of Ramadan is held every 29th of Sha'ban. The announcement by the Minister

of Religion regarding 1 Ramadan and Eid al-Fitr is a moment that people throughout the country eagerly await.

In the book *Agenda of the Ministry of Religious Affairs 1950-1952*, published by the Publication and Editorial Section of the State Printing Office - Jakarta, in the Chapter on the Decree of the Ministry of Religious Affairs on Public Holidays, there is an explanation, "The determination of Islamic Holidays, especially the beginning of the Ramadan Fast, in addition to taking into account the circulation of the moon, is also based on rukyat, therefore the determination of the date of 1 Ramadan and Eid al-Fitr must wait for rukyatul hilal which will be announced in due course."³³

During Minister of Religious Affairs KH Saifuddin Zuhri, the Decree of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 47 of 1963 concerning the Details of the Organization and Work Procedures of the Ministry of Religious Affairs was issued as an improvement on the previous regulation. In Article 26, the Decree of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 47 of 1963 outlined 47 duties of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, including "determining the dates of holidays designated as holidays." The mechanism for determining the beginning of Ramadan, Eid al-Fitr, and Eid al-Adha was then institutionalized into the Isbat Session at the Ministry of Religious Affairs.

One of the monumental steps taken by the Ministry of Religious Affairs in the 1970s was to form the Hisab and Rukyat Agency (BHR). The Hisab and Rukyat Agency was formed based on the Decree of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 76 of 1972. Sa'adoeddin Djambek, a prominent Muhammadiyah astronomy expert, first chaired it. The Hisab and Rukyat Agency

³² Ahmad Fadholi, *Isbat Session, Urgency and Dynamics*, Assyari'ayyah, Vol. 4, No. 2, December 2019, pp. 147 - 169

³³ Muhammad Zaki Mubarak, Youla Afifah Azkarrula, *Rejection of Isbat Syawal in Jepara and*

Cakung in 1432 H from the Perspective of Law and Astronomy, ASTROISLAMICA: Journal of Islamic Astronomy, Vol. 2 No. 1 June 2023, Page: 47-75

membership consisted of competent scholars/experts from various elements of organizations and related agencies. The Minister of Religious Affairs for the period 1971 - 1978, Prof. HA Mukti Ali, when inaugurating the members of the Hisab and Rukyat Agency in August 1972, conveyed three things regarding the role and duties of the Hisab and Rukyat Agency, as follows: First, determining Islamic holy days and national holidays that apply throughout Indonesia. Second, unifying the determination of the beginning of the Islamic month related to Muslim worship, such as 1 Ramadan, 1 Shawwal (Eid al-Fitr), and 10 Zulhijjah (Eid al-Adha). Third, the unity of the Muslim community must be maintained, conflicts and differences in the views of hisab and rukyat experts must be overcome, and differences in participation in building the nation and state must be minimized.

Since the last decade, the Hisab and Rukyat Agency under the Directorate General of Islamic Community Guidance has been changed to the Hisab and Rukyat Team and, more recently, the Hijri Calendar Unification Team. In the future, in line with the improvement in the performance of the Ministry of Religion, it may be necessary to reformulate the institutionalization of the Hisab and Rukyat agencies.³⁴

In this context, the state does not interfere with the substance of worship but provides services and guidelines for the smooth implementation of prayer as long as needed. The role of the government through the Ministry of Religion is to facilitate the certainty of the time for the implementation of worship that requires state involvement in line with the mandate of the 1945 Constitution, Article 29. So far, there have

been several changes to regulations regarding the Organization and Work Procedures of the Ministry of Religion, such as PMA No. 72 of 2022, PMA No. 42 of 2016, PMA No. 10 of 2010, PMA No. 3 of 2006, or KMA No. 1 of 2001. The authority of the Minister of Religion to determine the dates of holidays or the start of fasting through the Isbat Session has not been explicitly normed recently.

In this regard, Law Number 3 of 2006 concerning Amendments to Law Number 7 of 1989 concerning Religious Courts, in Article 52 A, emphasizes that religious courts provide isbat of hilal rukyat testimony in determining the beginning of the month in the Hijri year. According to the Explanation of Article 52 A of the law, "So far, religious courts have been asked by the Minister of Religion to provide a determination (its bat) on the testimony of people who have seen or witnessed the hilal of the moon at each entry into the month of Ramadan and the beginning of the month of Shawwal in the Hijri year for the Minister of Religion to issue a national determination for the determination of 1 (one) Ramadan and 1 (one) Shawwal. Religious courts can provide information or advice regarding the differences in determining the qibla's direction and prayer times."³⁵

The determination of the beginning of the Qamariah month that is commonly done in our country uses the criteria of wujudul hilal and imkanur rukyat, namely the height of the recognized hilal. Muslims in Indonesia begin fasting during Ramadan and Eid al-Fitr by following two methods, namely hisab (astronomical calculations or the circulation of the moon) or the rukyat method (monitoring the moon). Both approaches have been institutionalized in society and

³⁴ DI Ansusa Putra and Addiarrahman, Quranic Exegesis Journalism In Islamic Magazines In Indonesia Between 1970-1980, Journal of Indonesian Islam (JIIs) Vol 17, No 2 (2023), DOI:<https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2023.17.2.483-509/>

³⁵ Suhardiman, Fiqh Hisab - Rukyat The Role of the Rukyat Hisab Body in the Dynamics of Determining the Beginning of the Lunar Month in Indonesia, At-Turats, Vol 12, No 1 (2018), DOI:<https://doi.org/10.24260/at-turats.v12i1.972>

coexist. The determination of the date of 1 Ramadan, 1 Shawwal, and 10 Zulhijjah is in scientific dialectics, not a matter of faith and the law of worship.

The issue of his rakyat in Indonesia often becomes a national issue, especially among Muslims about the issue of worship and Islamic holy days. Hisab rukyat is not only related to the problem of prayer and holy days, but its study is broader, such as the preparation of almanacs or calendars, estimates of eclipses and so on," explained Wahyu Widiana (2003), former Director of Religious Court Development at the Ministry of Religion and Director General of the Religious Courts of the Supreme Court in his remarks to the book *Kalender Urfi* by KH Banadji Aqil.

This session also received legitimacy from the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) through Fatwa Decree Number 2 of 2004 concerning the Determination of the Beginning of Ramadan, Shawwal, and Zulhijjah, which stipulates: First, the determination of the beginning of Ramadan, Shawwal, and Zulhijjah is carried out based on the rakyat and hisab method by the Indonesian Government cq Minister of Religious Affairs and applies nationally. Second, all Muslims in Indonesia must obey the Indonesian Government's provisions regarding the determination of the beginning of Ramadan, Shawwal, and Zulhijjah. Third, in determining the start of Ramadan, Shawwal, and Zulhijjah, the Minister of Religious Affairs must consult with the Indonesian Ulema Council, Islamic mass organizations, and related agencies. Fourth, the results of rakyat from areas where the crescent moon can be sighted even outside the territory of Indonesia, whose mathla' is the same as Indonesia, can be used as a guideline by the Indonesian Minister of Religious Affairs.

The 2016 MABIMS (Ministers of Religious Affairs of Brunei Darussalam, Indonesia, Malaysia, and Singapore) Technical Meeting resulted in points of agreement regarding the new criteria for the height of the moon of 3 degrees and the elongation of the moon (distance between the moon and the sun) of 6.4 degrees. The MABIMS criteria began to be used by the Ministry of Religious Affairs in the Isbat Session to determine 1 Ramadhan 1443 H/2022 AD. Previously, for several years in a row, there was no potential difference in the calculation of this and the results of rakyat in determining 1 Ramadhan and 1 Eid al-Fitr in our country. Because of the unifying natural factors, Ramadan and Eid al-Fitr fasting can be carried out simultaneously according to both the hisab and rukyat versions.³⁶

The Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI), and Islamic mass organizations have discussed the Unification of the Hijri Calendar or Global Islamic Calendar. Several experts who were present came from representatives of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Indonesia, the High Religious Court, the Meteorology, Climatology, and Geophysics Agency (BMKG), the National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN), the Geospatial Information Agency (BIG), Nahdlatul Ulama, Muhammadiyah, Al-Washliyah, and Persis. Also present at that time were individual hisab-rukya experts, astronomers, and academics from various universities. The strategic and transformative steps of the Ministry of Religious Affairs to mature the unification of the Islamic Calendar need to be continued. Unifying the Islamic Calendar requires a new perspective and optimal use of science. It would be better if there were a way to unite the people to start

³⁶ Maskufa, Sopa, Sri Hidayati, and Adi Damanhuri, Implementation of the New MABIMS Crescent Visibility Criteria: Efforts to Unite the Hijriyah

Calendar in the Southeast Asian Region, AHKAM - Volume 22, Number 1, 2022

Collective Ijtihad Practice in Indonesia: The Role of Isbat Sessions in Addressing Legal Paradigm Differences...
Ramadan fast and simultaneously celebrate Eid al-Fitr and Eid al-Adha.³⁷

The Impact of The Isbat Trial as A Legal Concession

The bat session has a vital role in resolving differences in Islamic legal paradigms related to determining the beginning of the Hijri month, especially in the context of worship, such as Ramadan, Eid al-Fitr, and Eid al-Adha. These differences often arise due to different approaches to understanding sharia, namely between the rakyat method (direct observation of the moon) and his (astronomical calculations). Experts in the literature and studies of the bat session have expressed several significant impacts of the bat session, such as:

First, Building Muslim Consensus. The bat session demonstrated the importance of dialogue and deliberation as the Islamic way to resolve differences. It is an example for Muslims of how differences of opinion can be resolved through a democratic and inclusive process. The bat session is a forum for deliberation involving various parties, such as clerics, Islamic organizations, and the government. This forum seeks to find common ground amid differences of opinion to produce a decision that most Muslims in Indonesia can accept.

Second, Accommodating Differences in Schools and Scientific Approaches. The bat session reflects tolerance for differences in methods in Islam. By involving the rakyat and his approaches, this forum seeks to maintain a balance between religious traditions and the advancement of modern

science. The bat session involves various parties, such as scholars, astronomers, community leaders, and the government. This reflects an inclusive approach to respecting differences of opinion among Muslims while seeking standard solutions.³⁸ Third, Ensuring Compliance with Sharia Principles. This session ensures that decisions follow Sharia principles by considering scientific data (hisab) and empirical evidence (rukyat). This gives the community a sense of confidence that the decision is religiously valid.³⁹ The bat trial process also serves as an educational medium for the public to understand the importance of understanding the differences in methods for determining the Islamic calendar and how to respond to them wisely.

Fourth, Legal certainty and social life should be increased. The decisions resulting from the bat session provide legal certainty to the community. This is important to avoid confusion in implementing worship or celebrating big days and to maintain social order. The law must always be consistent with general principles but can be adjusted to the conditions of the times.⁴⁰

Fifth, Strengthening State Authority. As a country with a Muslim majority, the isbat session is an official mechanism to ensure that the determination of Islamic holy days is recognized nationally. This helps avoid potential social conflict due to differences in determining the date. The results of the bat session became the government's official reference for determining the beginning of the Hijri month. This helps maintain social

³⁷ Muhammad Zaki Mubarak, Youla Afifah Azkarrula, Rejection of Isbat Syawal in Jepara and Cakung in 1432 H from the Perspective of Law and Astronomy, *ASTROISLAMICA: Journal of Islamic Astronomy*, Vol. 2 No. 1 June 2023, Page: 47-75

³⁸ Ahmad Hanany Naseh, Ijtihad in Islamic Law, *An-Nur Journal*, Vol. IV, No. 2, August 2012

³⁹ Syahrul Anwar, Aden Rosadi, Fauzan, Retracing The Position Of Sharia Science In The Formulation

Of Laws And Regulations, *MADANIA* Vol. 24, No. 2, December 2020

⁴⁰ Putra, DA, Sayuti, S., & Rahim, RAA. (2024). Inconsistency of Salafi's Bid'ah Concept: Shifting The Quran-Hadis Law Consideration During Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia. *Al-Risalah: Forum for Legal and Social Studies*, 24(1), 116–134. <https://doi.org/10.30631/alrisilah.v24i1.1523>

order, especially when implementing religious holidays involving the wider community.⁴¹

Sixth, Realizing the Unity of the Ummah. The bat session aims to unify the views of Muslims in determining critical times based on mutually accepted methods. This session becomes a forum to find common ground in the context of differences in hisab (astronomical calculation) and rukyat (direct observation of the crescent moon) methods. As a multicultural and multireligious country, Indonesia faces unique challenges in maintaining harmony. The bat session shows how Islamic law can be implemented contextually without sacrificing the principles of Sharia. With the bat session, differences of opinion can be managed constructively through dialogue and deliberation. This helps reduce the potential for conflict or confusion in society that may arise from differences in religious practices.⁴²

Although the isbat session does not eliminate differences, it creates harmony and unity among the plurality of Muslims. Its success depends on the spirit of deliberation and mutual respect among the parties involved. The bat session is not only about determining the beginning of the Hijri month but is also a manifestation of efforts to harmonize Islamic law amidst diverse views. This forum symbolizes how Islam in Indonesia can integrate the values of tradition, science, and national interests to maintain the unity of the people.

Conclusion

The Isbat Session of 1 Syawal in Indonesia can be categorized as a collective ijtihad practice because it involves the deliberation of various parties with

relevant expertise, using scientific and religious methods, and producing joint decisions. This process positively contributes to maintaining the harmony of spiritual life in Indonesia. However, it does not eliminate differences of opinion, especially when dealing with the problems of his-rakyat. This conclusion can be seen from the similarities in the characteristics, functions, and impacts of both (Isbat Session and Collective Ijtihad). The Isbat Session practices the collectivity and participation of various parties, including scholars, astronomers, religious organizations, and the government. The Isbat Session practices the Sharia principle of deliberation based on scientific and Sharia data to reach a decision. In addition, the results of the Isbat session are announced to the public as an official guideline for carrying out worship. The Isbat session also had a positive impact on religious life in Indonesia. Unity of the people: The official government decision becomes a standard reference, although differences still exist in some circles. Certainty of worship: Provides a uniform guideline for implementing Eid al-Fitr. Maintaining social harmony: Reducing the potential for conflict due to differences in determining the start of the month.

Bibliography

Amin Rido, Problems of Jama'i Ijtihad in the Face of Modernity, Thesis, Faculty of Sharia, UIN Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, 2001

⁴¹ Jaenal Arifin, Dialectics of the Relationship between Astronomy and Determination of the Beginning of Ramadhan, Syawal, Dzulhijjah in Indonesia (Synergy Between the Independence of Scientists and State Authority), Research Journal, Volume. 13, Number 1, February 2019.

⁴² Saffanah, T., Rasito, R., Putra, DA, & Yuliatin, Y. (2024). Strengthening Law Enforcement and Public Awareness to Combat Human Trafficking in Indonesia: Challenges and Solutions. *Al-Ahkam: Journal of Sharia and Legal Sciences*, 9(2), 91-112.

- Andoko. Study on Building Collective Ijtihad as an Effort of Istibat Al Ahkam Against Contemporary Events. *Responsive Law Journal*, [SI], v. 7, n. 7, p. 40-52, May 2019.
- Arifin, Jaenal, Dialectics of the Relationship between Astronomy and Determination of the Beginning of Ramadhan, Syawal, Dzulhijjah in Indonesia (Synergy Between the Independence of Scientists and State Authority), *Research Journal*, Volume. 13, Number 1, February 2019.
- Anwar, Syahrul, Aden Rosadi, Fauzan, Retracing The Position Of Sharia Science In The Formulation Of Laws And Regulations, *MADANIA* Vol. 24, No. 2, December 2020
- Azizah, Nur, Mhd Syahnan, and Budi Sastra Panjaitan. "The Legality of Abortion by Medical Personnel for Rape Victims in Indonesia: A Perspective from Maqashid Sharia by al-Syatibi and al-Tufi." *Madania: Journal of Islamic Studies* 28.1 (2024): 35-44.
- Azhari, Susiknan, Characteristics of the Relationship between Muhammadiyah and NU in Using Hisab and Rukyat, *Al-Jami'ah*, Vol. 44, No. 2, 2006 M/1427 H
- Abdul Haq, Muhamad Adib, Implementation of Ru'yah Al-Hilāl from the Perspective of the Pbnū Falakiyah Institution (Study on the Cancellation of Istikmal in the Month of Jumadil Awal 1438 H / 2017 M), Thesis, UIN Walisongo Semarang, 2022.
- Erwan, Erwan. "Takhrij Al-Furu' Alal Usul Periode Ijtihad Di Masa Shahabat Dan Tabi'in (Kajian Sosiologi-Antropologi Hukum Islam)." *JURIS (Jurnal Ilmiah Syariah)* 17.2 (2018): 161-179.
- Fadholi, Ahmad, Isbat Session, Urgency and Dynamics, *Assyari'ayyah*, Vol. 4, No. 2, December 2019, pp. 147 - 169
- Hidayat, Muhammad, and Muhammad Ikhlas bin Rosele. "Modernization Of Fiqh In Contemporary Era: A Study of Yusuf Al-Qardhawi's Fiqh Thought." *MIQOT: Journal of Islamic Sciences* 48.1 (2024): 73-87.
- Hasan, A. (2003). An Introduction to Collective Ijtihad (Ijtihad Jama'i): Concept and Applications. *American Journal of Islam and Society*, 20(2), 26-49.
<https://doi.org/10.35632/ajis.v20i2.520>.
- Harnowo, Tri, and Fachry Hasani Habib. "Islamic Law and Environment Issues: Indonesian Ulama Council's Fatwas on Climate Change." *AHKAM: Jurnal Ilmu Syariah* 24.1 (2024): 101-118.
- Hosen, Nadirsyah, Nahdlatul Ulama and Collective Ijtihad, *New Zealand Journal of Asian Studies* 6, 1 (June 2004): 5-26.
- Helim, Abdul, Hamka's Legal Methodology on Hisab-Ru'yah in His Book "I Return to Ru'yah," *JURIS (Jurnal Ilmiah Syariah)*, Vol. 23, No. 2 (2024), pp. 215-226, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.31958/juris.v23i2.11952/>
- Haryanto, AM (2023). Hisab and Rukyat in Determining the Beginning of the Qamariyah Month in Indonesia from a Hadith Perspective. *Al-Mu'tabar*, 3(2), 45-60.
<https://doi.org/10.56874/jurnalilmu hadis.v3i2.1553>
- Hefni, Wildani, Commodification of Religion in the Polemic on Determining the Beginning of the Qamariah Month in Indonesia, *Al-Marshad: Journal of*

- Islamic Astronomy and Related Sciences, Vol 6, No 1 (2020). <https://doi.org/10.24269/muaddib.v5i1.114>.
- Izzuddin, Ahmad, Dynamics of Hisab Rukyat in Indonesia. (2015). *Istinbath: Journal of Law*, 12(2), 248-273. <https://e-journal.metrouniv.ac.id/istinbath/article/view/584>
- Kasdi, Abdurrohman. "Reconstruction of Nusantara fiqh: Developing the Ijtihad methodology in formulating fiqh from an Indonesian perspective." *QIJIS STAIN KUDUS* 7.2 (2019): 239-266.
- Khan, S. (2024). Collective Ijtihad: Regulating Fatwa in Postnormal Times: (By Hossam Sabry Othman). *American Journal of Islam and Society*, 41(3-4), 102-107. <https://doi.org/10.35632/ajis.v41i3-4.3561>
- Laluddin, Hayatullah. "Maslahah's Role as an Instrument for Revival of Ijtihad." *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 8 (2015): 27.
- Laluddin, Hayatullah. "Maslahah's Role as an Instrument for Revival of Ijtihad." *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 8 (2015): 27.
- Maqbool Hassan, The Concept of Collective Ijtihad, its Need and Role in the Development of Islamic Law and Legislation in the Modern Era, *almithaq Journal*, 6 Sep 2024, <https://almithaqjournal.org/index.php/home/article/view/66/62>
- Artinyain, Ijtihad Jama'i as a "Solution" to Social Problems, *Jurnal Asy-Syir'ah* Vol. 43 No. II, 200
- Munfaridah, Imroatul, Problems of Hisab Rukyah in Determining the Beginning of Ramadan and Solutions in Indonesia, *MUADDIB: Educational and Islamic Studies*, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.24269/muaddib.v5i1.114>.
- Mulyadi, Achmad. "Non-Astronomical Aspects of the Success of Rukyatul Hilal in East Java." *Samarah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga dan Hukum Islam* 8.3 (2024): 1859-1880.
- Al Munawar, Faishal Agil and Mirwan, Ijtihad Jama'i (Collective Ijtihad) Perspective of Contemporary Ulama, *Journal of Islamic Economics and Law* Volume 4, Number 2, October 2020, DOI: 10.35316/istidlal.v4i1.268
- Maskufa, Sopa, Sri Hidayati, and Adi Damanhuri, Implementation of the New MABIMS Crescent Visibility Criteria: Efforts to Unite the Hijriyah Calendar in the Southeast Asian Region, *AHKAM - Volume 22*, Number 1, 2022
- Naseh, Ahmad Hanany, IJTIHAD IN ISLAMIC LAW, *An-Nûr Journal*, Vol. IV, No. 2, August 2012
- Qulub, Siti Tatmainul, and Ahmad Munif. "The Urgency of Fatwa and Isbat Assemblies in Determining the Beginning of the Month of Kamariah in Indonesia." *Jurnal Bimas Islam* 16, no. 2 (December 29, 2023): 423-452. Accessed January 1, 2025. <https://jurnalbimasislam.kemenag.go.id/jbi/article/view/929>.
- Qulub, Siti Tatmainul, Critical Review of the Decision of the Itsbat Trial for Determining the Beginning of the Qamariyah Month in Indonesia from the Perspective of Usul Fiqh, *Al-Ahkam*, Volume 25, Number 1, April 2015
- Pauzi M and Darul Hipni, The Importance Of The Ijtihad Jama'i Method In Contemporary Fiqh Formulations, *Al-Risalah Forum Kajian Hukum dan Sosial Kemasyarakatan* Vol. 23 No. 1,

- Collective Ijtihad Practice in Indonesia: The Role of Isbat Sessions in Addressing Legal Paradigm Differences...
June 2023 (pp. 13-20), DOI:
10.30631/alrisalah.v23i1.1322
- Putra, DI, Sayuti, S., & Rahim, RAA. (2024). Inconsistency of Salafi's Bid'ah Concept: Shifting The Quran-Hadis Law Consideration During Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia. *Al-Risalah: Forum for Legal and Social Studies*, 24(1), 116-134. <https://doi.org/10.30631/alrisalah.v24i1.1523>
- Putra, DI Ansusa and Addiarrahman, Quranic Exegesis Journalism In Islamic Magazines In Indonesia Between 1970-1980, *Journal of Indonesian Islam (JIIs)* Vol 17, No 2 (2023), DOI: <https://10.15642/JIIS.2023.17.2.483-509/>
- Ridwan, Contestation of Hisab-Rukyat Schools in Indonesia, *Pustaka Ilmu*, 2022
- Rokhim, Abdur. "An Analysis of the Arguments of the Hisab and Rukyat Methods in the Perspective of Contextual Interpretation." *Jurnal Bimas Islam*, Vol. 17, no. 1.
- Rojak, Encep Abdul, and Ramdan Fawzi. "The Normative Basis of Islamic Astronomy For The Transformation of Prayer Schedules To Digital And Its Accuracy." *El-Usrah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga* 7.2 (2024).
- Royyani, Muh Arif, et al. "Shahadah'Ilmy; Integrating Fiqh and Astronomy Paradigm in Determining The Arrival of Lunar Months in Indonesia." *AL-IHKAM: Jurnal Hukum & Pranata Sosial* 16.2 (2021): 503-524.
- Sahid, Mochammad, Mualimin, Habibulla, Abdul Rahman Cemda, Mario, Kasturi, Lunar Crescent Visibility Criteria in Determining the New Islamic Month in Malaysia, *Al-Hisab: Journal of Islamic Astronomy*, Vol.1, No.4, December 2024, pp. 197 - 209, <https://jurnal.umsu.ac.id/index.php/alhisab/article/view/21764>
Email:
mualimin.sahid@usim.edu.my197
- Suhardiman, Fiqh Hisab - Rukyat The Role of the Rukyat Hisab Body in the Dynamics of Determining the Beginning of the Lunar Month in Indonesia, *At-Turats*, Vol 12, No 1 (2018), DOI: <https://doi.org/10.24260/at-turats.v12i1.972>
- Saffanah, T., Rasito, R., Putra, DI Ansusa, & Yuliatin, Y. (2024). Strengthening Law Enforcement and Public Awareness to Combat Human Trafficking in Indonesia: Challenges and Solutions. *Al-Ahkam: Journal of Sharia and Legal Sciences*, 9(2), 91-112. <https://doi.org/10.22515/alahkam.v9i2.9686>
- Sudirman, Sudirman, Edi Gunawan, and Kasjim Salenda. "Method of law istinbath jama'ah al-Nadzir: determination of the beginning of the month of Ramadhan." *Ijtihad: Jurnal Wacana Hukum Islam dan Kemanusiaan* 19.2 (2019): 259-270
- Wehr, Hans, *A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic*, (Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1993), pp. 141-142. See also Ali Hasballah, *Usul at-Tasyri' al-Islamy*, (Egypt: Dar al-Ma'arif, 1971), p. 79.
- Zaki Mubarak, Muhammad, Youla Afifah Azkarrula, Rejection of Isbat Syawal in Jepara and Cakung in 1432 H from the Perspective of Law and Astronomy, *ASTROISLAMICA: Journal of Islamic Astronomy*, Vol. 2 No. 1 June 2023, Page: 47-75 DOI:<https://doi.org/10.47766/astroislamica.v1i1.1250>